Table 1 Correlation Between the Number of Years on Welfare During Each Childhood Period

| Childhood welfare | Bivariate Correlation Coefficients |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| (1) years on welfare, age 0-5 | 1.000 |  | $(3)$ | $(4)$ |
| (2) years on welfare, age 6-10 | $.700^{* * *}$ | 1.000 |  |  |
| (3) years on welfare, age 11-15 | $.573^{* * *}$ | $.776^{* * *}$ | 1.000 |  |
| (4) years on welfare, age 0-15 | $.842^{* * *}$ | $.934^{* * *}$ | $.888^{* * *}$ | 1.000 |

[^0]Table 2 Distribution of Entrance into Welfare by Childhood Stage

| Childhood stage | \# of children <br> receiving welfare <br> in stage | $\%$ of children who started receiving welfare in stage |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| (1) Age 0-5 | 369 | $(1)$ | $(2)$ | $(3)$ |
| (2) Age 6-10 | 415 | 65.1 | 0 | 0 |
| (3) Age 11-15 | 364 | 61.8 | 24.9 | 0 |
| (4) Age 0-15 | 565 | 65.3 | 24.2 | 14.0 |

Source: Panel Study of Income Dynamics

Table 3 Effect of Different Measures of Parental Welfare Receipt on Children's Completed Years of Schooling by Age 23,

| Variables | Childhood Period | (1) | (2) | (3) | Childhood Period | (4) | (5) | (6) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Model 1 | Model 2 | Model 3 |  | Model 1 | Model 2 | Model 3 |
| Ever on welfare | Ages 0 to15 | $\begin{gathered} \hline-.853 * * * \\ (.137) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} -.512 * * * \\ (.136) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \hline-.319^{*} \\ & (.183) \end{aligned}$ | Ages 0 to 5 | $\begin{gathered} \hline-.493 * * \\ (.194) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline-.398 * * \\ (.181) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} -.455^{* *} \\ (.203) \end{gathered}$ |
|  |  |  |  |  | Ages 6 to 10 | $\begin{aligned} & -.218 \\ & (.222) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -.004 \\ & (.208) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -.072 \\ & (.222) \end{aligned}$ |
|  |  |  |  |  | Ages 11 to 15 | $\begin{gathered} -.572 * * \\ (.221) \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} -.509^{* *} \\ (.203) \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} -.412 * * \\ (.207) \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ |
| Years on welfare | Ages 0 to15 | $\begin{gathered} \hline-.110^{* * *} \\ (.017) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline-.081 * * * \\ (.017) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline-.086 * * * \\ (.023) \end{gathered}$ | Ages 0 to 5 | $\begin{aligned} & \hline .099 \\ & (.061) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \hline-.094^{*} \\ & (.057) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline-.140^{* *} \\ (.063) \end{gathered}$ |
|  |  |  |  |  | Ages 6 to 10 | $\begin{aligned} & -.073 \\ & (.069) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -.051 \\ & (.064) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -.057 \\ & (.066) \end{aligned}$ |
|  |  |  |  |  | Ages 11 to 15 | $\begin{gathered} -.160^{* *} \\ (.062) \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -.104^{*} \\ & (.057) \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} -.081 \\ (.057) \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ |
| Annual welfare | Ages 0 to15 | $\begin{gathered} \hline-.175 * * * \\ (.029) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline-.126 * * * \\ (.028) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline-.105 * * * \\ (.034) \end{gathered}$ | Ages 0 to 5 | $\begin{aligned} & -.049 \\ & (.032) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -.039 \\ & (.030) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline-.049 \\ (.031) \end{gathered}$ |
| Income $\text { (in } \$ 1,000 \text { ) }$ |  |  |  |  | Ages 6 to 10 | $\begin{aligned} & -.033 \\ & (.042) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -.033 \\ & (.038) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} -.020 \\ (.039) \end{gathered}$ |
|  |  |  |  |  | Ages 11 to 15 | $\begin{gathered} -.110^{* *} \\ (.051) \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{array}{r} -.059 \\ (.047) \end{array}$ | $\begin{gathered} -.040 \\ (.047) \end{gathered}$ |

$\overline{\mathrm{N}=1219,}{ }^{*}=$ significant at $10 \%$ level, ${ }^{* *}=$ significant at $5 \%$ level, ${ }^{* * *}=$ significant at $1 \%$ level, Standard errors in parentheses
Model (1) also includes race, sex, birth order, poverty status of grandparents, religion, region of residence, location of residence (SMSA or not), proportion of years when the head was disabled, the county unemployment rate, and birth cohort. Model (2) adds parents' education, average family income and family size.
Model (3) adds mother's age at individual's birth, the number of siblings, proportion of years with one parent, proportion of years with head other than parents, proportion of years when the parent's marital status changed, father's and mother's work hours, proportion of years when the mother worked, and proportion of years when the family moved.

Table 4 Effect of Parental Welfare Receipt on Children's Educational Attainment Estimated with Sibling Sample

|  | Cross-section |  |  | Fixed-effect |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) |
|  | Model 1 | Model 2 | Model 3 | Model 1 | Model 2 | Model 3 |
| Years on welfare | Years of completed schooling by 23 |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | -.112*** | $-.088 * * *$ | -.082*** | -.224* | -.237* | -. 298 |
|  | (.021) | (.022) | (.032) | (.124) | (.125) | (.183) |
| Annual welfare Income | $-.167^{* * *}$ | -.128*** | -.092** | -.570*** | -.596*** | -.744*** |
| (in \$1,000) | (.036) | (.034) | (.043) | (.153) | (.162) | (.250) |
| \# of cases(pairs) |  | 813 cases |  |  | 269 pairs |  |
|  | High school completion by 19 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Years on welfare | $-.143^{* * *}$ | $-.086 * * *$ | $-.086 * * *$ | -. 159 | -. 158 | -.244* |
|  | (.014) | (.017) | (.024) | (.099) | (.101) | (.147) |
| Annual welfare Income | -.279*** | $-.174 * * *$ | $-.144 * * *$ | -.375** | -.350** | -.492** |
| (in \$1,000) |  | (.038) | (.047) | (.152) | (.165) | (.249) |
| \# of cases (pairs) |  | 1561 cases |  |  | 218 pairs |  |
|  | Years of completed schooling by 19 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Years on welfare | -.077*** | -.051*** | -.038** | -.092*** | -.093** | -.111* |
|  | (.009) | (.010) | (.015) | (.034) | (.037) | (.057) |
| Annual welfare Income | -.122*** | -.077*** | -.041* | -.060 | -. 052 | -. 050 |
| (in \$1,000) | (.016) | (.017) | (.021) | (.079) | (.079) | (.084) |
| \# of cases (pairs) |  | 1419 cases |  |  | 796 pairs |  |

[^1]Standard errors (Huber standard errors of fixed-effect estimates) in parentheses

Cross-sectional models also contain the same controls as the corresponding model in table 3 .
Fixed-effect models
Model 1 also includes a dummy for a female and male pair, a dummy for a first born and younger pair, and a dummy for a pair missing birth order. Region of residence during childhood,
location of residence (SMSA or not), proportion of years with head disabled, unemployment rate, and birth cohort are included in a differenced form.
Model 2 adds average family income and family size (in a differenced form).
Model 3 adds number of siblings, proportion of years with one parent, proportion of years with head other than parent, proportion of years when parent's marital status changed, father's work hours, mother's work hours, proportion of years when mother worked, and proportion of years when family moved (in a differenced form).

Table 5 Childhood Stage-Specific Effects of Parental Welfare Receipt on Children's Educational Attainment Estimated with Sibling Sample

|  | Cross-section |  |  | Fixed-effect |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) |
|  | Model 1 | Model 2 | Model 3 | Model 1 | Model 2 | Model 3 |
|  | Years of completed schooling by 23 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Years on welfare |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Age 0-5 | -. 120 (.082) | -. 121 (.077) | -. 126 (.085) | -. 087 (.201) | -. 093 (.216) | -. 205 (.268) |
| Age 6-10 | -. 028 (.085) | -. 029 (.078) | -. 023 (.084) | $-.318^{* * *}(.113)$ | $-.321 * * *(.117)$ | -.296* (.166) |
| Age 11-15 | $-.197 * * *(.072)$ | $-.125^{*}(.066)$ | -. 108 (.069) | $-.400 * *(.180)$ | -.411** (.178) | -. 411 * (.219) |
| Welfare Income (in \$1,000) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Age 0-5 | -. 048 (.040) | -. 044 (.037) | -. 039 (.040) | $-.258 * * *(.080)$ | $-.266 * * *(.084)$ | $-.316 * * *(.105)$ |
| Age 6-10 | -.025 (.049) | -. 037 (.044) | -.022 (.045) | $-.190^{* * *}(.066)$ | $-.194 * * *(.068)$ | -.176* (.094) |
| Age 11-15 | -.109* (.056) | -. 048 (.051) | -. 034 (.053) | -.326* (.174) | $-.325^{*}(.181)$ | -. 216 (.205) |
| \# of cases(pairs) |  | 813 cases |  |  | 269 pairs |  |
|  | High school completion by 19 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Years on welfare |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Age 0-5 | $-.166^{* *}(.069)$ | -. 099 (.073) | -. 069 (.083) | . 108 (.189) | . 159 (.180) | . 191 (.232) |
| Age 6-10 | -. 076 (.074) | -. 043 (.074) | -. 049 (.081) | $-.350 * *(.156)$ | -.322** (.162) | $-.422 *(.221)$ |
| Age 11-15 | $-.216^{* * *}(.062)$ | $-.143^{* *}(.064)$ | $-.112 *$ (.067) | $-.508 * *(.215)$ | $-.510^{* *}(.221)$ | $-.592^{* *}(.247)$ |
| Welfare Income (in $\$ 1,000$ ) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Age 0-5 | $-.086 * *(.040)$ | -. 040 (.040) | -. 030 (.042) | -. 037 (.118) | -. 027 (.118) | -. 078 (.1.32) |
| Age 6-10 | -.088* (.046) | $-.072 *(.043)$ | -.064 (.045) | $-.214 * *$ (.087) | -.212** (.092) | $-.257 * *(.113)$ |


| Age 11-15 | $-.106^{* *}(.047)$ | -. 056 (.044) | -. 044 (.046) | -. 151 (.152) | -. 157 (.157) | -. 187 (.166) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| \# of cases (pairs) |  | 1561 cases |  |  | 218 pairs |  |
|  | Years of completed schooling by 19 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Years on welfare |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Age 0-5 | $-.096 * * *(.035)$ | $-.066 *$ (.035) | -. 048 (.039) | -. 031 (.057) | -.025 (.057) | . 002 (.074) |
| Age 6-10 | -. 043 (.038) | -. 029 (.037) | -. 021 (.039) | -. 079 (.066) | -. 071 (.065) | -. 079 (.077) |
| Age 11-15 | $-.096 * * *(.033)$ | $-.063 * *(.032)$ | -. 046 (.033) | $-.275 * * *(.086)$ | $-.267 * * *(.085)$ | $-.279 * * *(.088)$ |
| Welfare Income (in \$1,000) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Age 0-5 | $-.060 * * *(.018)$ | $-.039 * *(.018)$ | -. 028 (.019) | -.017 (.035) | -.013 (.036) | -. 007 (.042) |
| Age 6-10 | -. 024 (.021) | -. 018 (.020) | -. 004 (.021) | -. 011 (.033) | -. 010 (.031) | -. 010 (.033) |
| Age 11-15 | -.042* (.023) | -.022 (.022) | -. 013 (.022) | . 027 (.061) | . 025 (.060) | . 031 (.061) |
| \# of cases (pairs) |  | 1419 cases |  |  | 796 pairs |  |

*= significant at $10 \%$ level, ${ }^{* *}=$ signific ant at 5\% level, ${ }^{* * *}=$ significant at $1 \%$ level,
Standard errors (Huber standard errors of fixed-effect estimates) in parentheses
Each model contains the same controls as the corresponding model in table 4.

Table 6 Effect of Long-Term Welfare Participation and High Welfare Income on Children's Educational Attainment: Fixed Effect Estimates (Full sample)

|  | (1) | (2) | (3) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Model 1 | Model 2 | Model 3 |
|  | Years of completed schooling by 23 |  |  |
| Long-term welfare (>5 yrs, $n=39$ pairs) | $\begin{gathered} -.361 * * \\ (.167) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} -.371 * * \\ (.171) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -.367 \\ & (.233) \end{aligned}$ |
| High welfare income (>=\$1,000, $\mathrm{n}=42$ pairs) (in $\$ 1,000$ ) | $\begin{gathered} -.618 * * * \\ (.174) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} -.636 * * * \\ (.180) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} -.695 * * * \\ (.244) \end{gathered}$ |
| High school completion by 19 |  |  |  |
| Long-term welfare (>5 yrs, $\mathrm{n}=54$ pairs) | $\begin{aligned} & \hline-.286 * \\ & (.145) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline-.282^{*} \\ (.150) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline-.349 * \\ (.195) \end{gathered}$ |
| High welfare income $(>=\$ 1,000, \mathrm{n}=67)$ <br> (in $\$ 1,000$ ) | $\begin{gathered} -.436 * * \\ (.176) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} -.410 * * \\ (.189) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} -.545 * * \\ (.267) \end{gathered}$ |


|  |  | Years of completed schooling by 19 |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Long-term welfare <br> $(>5$ yrs, $\mathrm{n}=128$ pairs $)$ | $-.192^{* * *}$ | $(.05 * *)$ | $-.223^{* * *}$ |
|  | $(.054)$ | $(.066)$ |  |
| High welfare income | -.066 | -.056 | -.088 |
| $(>=\$ 1,000, \mathrm{n}=151)$ | $(.089)$ | $(.087)$ | $(.088)$ |
| $($ in $\$ 1,000)$ |  |  |  |

*= significant at $10 \%$ level, ${ }^{* *}=$ significant at $5 \%$ level, ${ }^{* * *}=$ significant at $1 \%$ level, Standard errors (Huber standard errors of fixed effect estimates) in parentheses

Models contain same controls as corresponding models in table 4.

Table 7 Effect of Patterns of Maternal Welfare Use and Involvement with Work on Children's Completed Years of Schooling

| by 23, Cross-Section Estimates |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | (1) | (2) | (3) |
|  | Model 1 | Model 2 | Model 3 |
| (Reference category: no welfare) |  |  |  |
| 0-250 hrs work and ever on welfare | $-1.315 * * *(.199)$ | $-.844 * * *(.196)$ | $-.639 * * *(.238)$ |
| 250-500 hrs work and ever on welfare | $-1.297 * * *(.237)$ | $-.928 * * *(.226)$ | $-.721 * * *(.257)$ |
| 500-750 hrs work and ever on welfare | -. 391 (.280) | -. 295 (.264) | -. 200 (.289) |
| 750-1000 hrs work and ever on welfare | -. 269 (.271) | -. 022 (.254) | . 048 (.281) |
| $1000+$ hrs work and ever on welfare | . 321 (.430) | . 318 (.396) | . 376 (.406) |

[^2]Models contain same controls as corresponding models in table 4.

Table 8 Effect of Maternal Involvement with Work and Short-term Versus Long-Term Welfare Use on Children's Education,
Cross Section Estimates

|  | $(1)$ <br> Model 1 | (2) <br> Model 2 | Model 3 |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |

Years of completed schooling by 19
$\left.\begin{array}{lll}\hline \text { (Reference category: no welfare) } \\ \begin{array}{l}\text { More than } 500 \text { hrs work and } 5 \text { or less years on } \\ \text { welfare }\end{array} & -.298^{* * *(.091)} & -.155^{*}(.089)\end{array}\right]-104(.103)$

* = significant at $10 \%$ level, $* *=$ significant at 5\% level, ${ }^{* * *}=$ significant at $1 \%$ level

Standard errors in parentheses

Models contain same control variables as in table 3.


[^0]:    Source: Panel Study of Income Dynamics

[^1]:    *= significant at $10 \%$ level, ${ }^{* *}=$ significant at 5\% level, ${ }^{* * *}=$ significant at $1 \%$ level,

[^2]:    $\mathrm{N}=1219, *=$ significant at $10 \%$ level, ${ }^{* *}=$ significant at 5\% level, ${ }^{* * *}=$ significant at $1 \%$ level Standard errors in parentheses

